

An Analysis of The Emerging Factors of FLA And FLE Based on Students' Perception

Maula Khoirunnisa*, Yazid Basthomi, Mirjam Anugerahwati

English Language Teaching, Universitas Negeri Malang

*Email: maulanisa9@gmail.com

Abstract: This qualitative survey study investigated the students' perspectives on the emerging factors of anxiety and enjoyment during ESP class of non-English department students. This study involved 35 freshmen of non-English department study program at Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang who were joining ESP class. The most frequent causes of FLA based on the students' perception were being afraid that their utterances are not understandable, their own concern on their pronunciation and accent and thoughts that others can speak better than they do. For FLE, the excellent atmosphere created by the teachers was most considered by the students to contribute to their enjoyment in class.

Keywords: anxiety, enjoyment, factors, ESP class

Abstrak: Penelitian yang menggunakan metode survey kualitatif ini menggali tentang perspektif mahasiswa di luar jurusan Bahasa Inggris tentang kecemasan (*FLA*) dan perasaan senang (*FLE*) dalam mengikuti kelas ESP. Penelitian ini melibatkan 35 mahasiswa yang bukan jurusan Bahasa Inggris di Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang yang mengikuti kelas ESP. Penyebab *FLA* yang paling sering terjadi berdasarkan persepsi mahasiswa adalah ketakutan bahwa ucapan mereka tidak dapat dimengerti, rasa cemas pribadi terhadap pengucapan dan aksen mereka serta pemikiran bahwa orang lain dapat berbicara lebih baik daripada mereka. Untuk *FLE*, suasana baik yang diciptakan oleh para guru menjadi sebuah perhatian khusus yang dirasa oleh para mahasiswa untuk menambah rasa senang mereka di kelas.

Kata kunci: kecemasan, kesenangan, faktor-faktor, kelas ESP

INTRODUCTION

There are many influencing factors which can interact with the process of the teaching and learning foreign language including the teaching, the learning process, the learners, and context (Jialing, 2019). In addition, Brown (2007) further included the teacher factors, and language factors on the list. The research focusing on the learners' factors, similarly to those in Second Language Acquisition (SLA) research. Since Jialing (2019) argued that each area of the factors has been extensively investigated in many studies which then gradually shifted their focus from the teaching to the learners. The researcher's focus then somehow ended up with the exploration of learners' individual differences in language learning such as emotions.

As to an emotion is a complex psychological state that involves three distinct components: a subjective experience, a physiological response, and a behavioral or expressive response (Hockenbury & Hockenbury, 2010), by all means emotions could not only be seen as a mere mental state that could be ignored in teaching and learning process. Even though, in this study, emotions are defined as bodily dispositions for situated action (Aragão, 2011; Booth & Pennebaker, 2018), they are at the heart of generally every learning process, and specifically in foreign language learning process. Accordingly, emotions certainly affect learning in general (Pekrun et al., 2002) and foreign learning in particular (Aguilar, 2013; Macintyre & Gregersen,

2012) since they are representing one's internal states and are closely tied up to one's actions and behavior (Tyng et al., 2017). Without emotions, boredom would occupy and little learning would take place (Dewaele, 2015). In short, language learning does not only rely solely on cognitive factors but also the affective.

Although emotions play significant role in foreign language learning, they have not gained adequate attention compared to other affective domains. In fact, "the classroom is an emotional place" (Pekrun, 2014) so people should start considering and giving meticulous attention to emotions in learning process (Pishghadam et al., 2016). Even though there are many studies related to the learners' emotions, mostly the studies explored more on the negative emotions, anxiety, such as in (Dewaele, 2007; Hidayati, 2018; Horwitz, 2001; Lu & Liu, 2011; Marwan, 2016; Teimouri et al., 2019; Yassin & Razak, 2018). These show that the more the subject is being explored, the more it is assumed to be important and made it, unsurprisingly, as the strongest predictors of success or failures in foreign language learning (MacIntyre, 1999). However, the introduction of positive psychology in applied linguistics has altered the important of both positive and negative emotions experienced by the learners. MacIntyre & Mercer (2014) claimed that it is worth trying and boosting the positive emotions by fostering engagement, increasing appreciation of meaning in life and its activity rather than combatting or avoiding the negative emotions.

Since there has been a shift away from an exclusive focus on negative emotions in SLA to a more holistic analysis of both negative and positive emotions in the past few years (Dewaele & MacIntyre, 2014; Shirvan & Taherian, 2018; Imai, 2010; Macintyre & Vincze, 2017; MacIntyre & Mercer, 2014), Macintyre & Gregersen (2012) introduced the concept of Positive Psychology (PosPsy) into SLA research. They emphasized that positive emotions are beyond pleasant feelings which then make the students aware of and to let them absorb the language input. Among many positive emotions, enjoyment is one of the most studied positive emotions in SLA research recently (Gregesen et al., 2017; Li et al., 2018). Since White & Murray (2015) argued in his work about Positive Education (PE) that it also has a beneficial impact on the student's well-being, it is believed to provide scientific information for creating proactive strategies to the student's mental health. Moreover, enjoyment in language learning is believed to help L2 learners better attend to, process and acquire a target language

(Dewaele & Alfawzan, 2018; Saito, 2018).

Regarding the facts that have been presented by the previous studies, the main factors that prompt the emergence of FLA and FLE are pertinent to teachers' variables, learners' variables, and the classroom social factors. Thus, the researcher is interested to investigate whether those factors also emerge in the context of Indonesian EFL classes or whether there are more factors which makes it different from EFL classes around the world. Since this study focuses on both foreign language anxiety (FLA) and enjoyment (FLE) that students in the context of Indonesian EFL classes experienced during their learning in the classroom, it is designed to allow the learners to describe their thoughts related to emotions in the classroom. By using their own words, the response from the learners is expected to give authentic standpoint.

In this study, the researcher does not only intend to investigate FLA and FLE within the context of Indonesian EFL classes, but also in ESP classrooms where the English program designed by Language Centre are as compulsory subject for both freshmen and transferred students of UMM. Regarding the preceding statement, it means that this program is provided for all students to give them knowledge of English use and allow them to relate the language with their field of study. In order to expect richer data and outcomes, the researcher intends to conduct this study in ESP classrooms for non-English department students. Moreover, the accessibility of the subjects which makes the researcher has full access in conducting the study, also allows it to be considered as another reason of choosing ESP students as the subject.

Therefore, this study is aimed to view the factors causing anxiety and enjoyment in English language class by exploring the perception of students coming from non-English department whether anxiety and enjoyment exist during their learning session in the classroom. This study will enrich the previous studies in which most of them focus on students who intended to join the class, while this study will collect the data from the non-English department students in which most of them join the English class because of it is compulsory and is needed to be completed as stated before. As the follow up on the existence of the anxiety and enjoyment in English language class, this study is also aimed to investigate more on the causes and/or contributing factors that make them feel anxious and enjoy English their learning in class.

Horwitz (2001) defined that anxiety is one of the most important affective factors influencing the success of learning and acquiring foreign or second language. This statement is also in line with what (Brown & Arnold, 2000) specify in their work that anxiety is the affective factor that most ubiquitously restrict the learning process, since it is associated with negative feelings. Many studies have concluded that the more the students possess the anxiety level, the lower the achievement they could gain. Early studies view FLA as a manifestation of other types of anxiety related to the students' negative emotional reactions (Horwitz, 1986), such as trait anxiety, test anxiety or public speaking anxiety (Scovel, 1978). Meanwhile Gardner & Macintyre (1993) defined FLA as the fear of apprehension occurring when students have to perform tasks in a target language. It often comes when the students think they are not proficient in their target language. More recently, Horwitz (2001) and other researchers agreed that FLA is a unique and distinct anxiety that is independent on other general types of anxiety.

In view of its important in Language Learning process, it is essential to examine the possible causes of FLA. Due to its concern on wider range of insight for effective teaching and learning, Zhang & Zhong (2012) suggested to categorize FLA's possible causes as learner-induced, classroom-related, and skill-specific anxiety.

Learner induced anxiety falls into the students' erroneous beliefs on a new language, self-perceived incompetence, students' competitive nature, and fear of negative evaluation (Zhang & Zhong, 2012). *Classroom-related anxiety* is mainly related to variables such as peers, teachers, or classroom practices/ atmosphere (Zhang & Zhong, 2012). *Skill-specific anxiety* can be simply summarized as the tension and frustration that students experience because of final assessment to their foreign language proficiency.

Enjoyment refers to 'the sense of satisfaction and rewards generated from the activity and/or the outcome of the activity (Jin & Zhang, 2018). As having been presented in the anxiety part, Dewaele & Macintyre (2016) put FLE into two separate dimensions, the social and the private. The former includes encouraging peers, nice teachers, and a supportive environment. The later encompasses the personal feeling that the students perceive during the learning in class.

FLE social here is separated into three factors by Jin & Zhang (2018), namely the enjoyment related to the teachers support which highlights the enjoyable

experiences related to foreign language teachers' supportive and encouraging attitude towards the students (Li et al., 2018); enjoyment related to the learning which is often related to the atmosphere in the class; and the enjoyment related to the peer support which underpins tolerance of mistakes (Jin & Zhang, 2018; Li et al., 2018) and sharing learning pressure as well as learning atmosphere.

Quite differently, FLE private refer to coalescence between the students' thoughts and feelings around a sense of accomplishment (Dewaele & Macintyre, 2016). Even though it seems to be separate from social dimension, FLE private could not completely cut its tie to FLE social. The role of teachers and peers is still obliquely visible.

Hence, this paper brings the research questions, what are the most frequent causes of FLA and FLE emerging in ESP classroom among non-English department students based on their perceptions?

METHOD

This study is qualitative survey study which purposed to investigate whether or not the Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA) and Foreign Language Enjoyment (FLE) exist in English for Specific Purposes classroom and scrutinize the factors of FLA and FLE experienced by the students by referring to previous literary studies. This study took place at Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang. 35 (thirty-five) freshmen of non-English Department students taking ESP productive skills classes. They were asked to fill out an FLAE questionnaire adapted from the FLCA scale questionnaire by Horwitz (1986) and the FLE questionnaire by Dewaele and MacIntyre (2016). Once the respondents had completed the FLAE questionnaire, the three of them were interviewed using semi-structured guide in order to confirm and to obtain detailed information related to their answers.

FINDINGS

Table 1 shows that the most anxiety provoking statement is the one related to the classroom. Since they were required to use the foreign language in the class as much as possible, they think that the communication among the students (the respondents and their friends) or to their teachers is important. However, something interesting occurred in the interview. From the all respondents who joined the interview (3 students) there were one who made a

counter-statement towards what she has chosen. In the questionnaire she confirmed herself being afraid that her utterances are not understandable by choosing 'yes' for the statement number 10. In contrary, during the interview, she stated that she did not feel shy or embarrassed when there was incorrect grammar within their utterances since the teacher will correct her mistakes and she thought that it was normal during the learning process. In addition she also thinks that even if her friends did not understand her utterances (in English) she could whenever switch or translate them in her native language.

S2: *'Well, when my grammar is wrong, I think it's okay though the teacher will surely ask me to repeat particular part (with correct grammar) and I'll gladly do so..... since I want myself to be able to speak English (properly), it's okay to correct the wrong one..... And I think I can use Indonesian (her native language) or Javanese whenever my friends didn't understand (my utterances).'*

Foreign language enjoyment and its possible causes

The result of the questionnaire regarding the students' perspectives on Foreign Language Enjoyment is presented in table 2. Table 2 shows that almost half of the items within the questionnaire obtain full 'yes' response from the respondents. In addition, the other half obtain above 85% response. Therefore it shows that almost all of the respondents' experience enjoyment in addition to their anxiety. The aforementioned findings are also supported by the result of the interview.

S2: *'Actually, the instructor didn't require us to be perfect (in English). For example, in speaking class, the instructor gave an example of good pronunciation, the right one. Then, when we used our own accent, Javanese, or my friend used Madurese, the instructor let us use it. I think the most important thing was that we want to try.'*

S3: *'Well, I do agree that ESP class is fun, and me and my friends together with the teacher laugh a lot in the class. But I don't think I could completely enjoy the class.'*

S1: *'...my classmates are also really supportive. We study together. In short, even though they laugh on my mistakes, in the end, they helped me (to study).'*

DISCUSSION

First of all, from the questionnaire it can be seen that the respondents are afraid that their utterances are not understandable and grammatically incorrect. This result seems to be in line with the study conducted by Gregersen (2003) stating that anxious students seem to be disturbed by their mistakes and tend to avoid the mistakes. Even though one of the three respondents was seemingly disturbed by the grammar mistake he made, he did not state that he tended to avoid mistakes in his speech. However, his following statement seems to indicate that he did avoid the mistake on grammar in his speech. It was proven when he said that he tended to use the simplest tenses and simple vocabulary in his speech.

Secondly, the respondents feel that the other students speak English better than they do. This time, in line with the findings by Price (1991) and Horwitz (2001), the students believe themselves as less-proficient which is the result of their own low evaluation on their competence. Some might think it is because some of their friends have taken English class even before they were accepted in the university, and some might think it is caused by their friend's intelligence. However, another argument stated by Price (1991) is not proven here. Since from the three respondents there were none who thought that they are 'ungifted' in learning English. All the three respondents in this study stated that they did not think that they were 'ungifted'.

In addition, all the respondents interviewed agreed that they experience considerable anxiety towards productive skills, that are speaking and writing. The 2 respondents stated that they experienced considerable anxiety towards speaking skill. It was mainly caused by the preparation before and their pronunciation during a public speaking such as presentation or expressing their ideas. This study found that the anxiety was frequently emerging in speaking class is supported by the argument stated by Harmer (2004) that the cause of anxiety emerges in the speaking classroom is because students feel overwhelmed since they are required to process linguistics inputs and produce their thoughts at the same time.

Different from the Foreign Language Anxiety (FLA), the respondents gave apparently surprising responses to Foreign Language Enjoyment. It is interesting to see that the enjoyment related to the social

Table 1. the result of FLA Questionnaire

Item no.	Items	Responses (%)
Learner-induced anxiety		
3	I always feel that the other students speak English better than I do.	71.4%
8	I worry when I got bad score in ESP class.	65.7%
1	I think good English is English used by native speaker, and it's too difficult for me.	37.1%
7	I worry that I could not pass my ESP class.	37.1%
4	I never feel quite sure of myself when I am speaking or writing in my ESP class.	31.4%
5	I get nervous when I don't understand every word ESP teacher says in English.	28.6%
6	My body was shaking when I know that I'm going to be called on in ESP class.	28.6%
2	I get frustrated when I can't use English as it was taught during the two semesters of ESP classes.	25.7%
Classroom-related anxiety		
10	I am afraid that the utterances I am talking about are not understandable and grammatically incorrect.	77%
9	I am afraid that the other students will laugh at me when I speak English.	37%
14	It frightens me when I don't understand what the teacher is saying in English.	31%
11	I think the teacher rarely helps me when I get difficulties in ESP class.	20%
13	I get upset when the teacher corrects me, and I don't understand how to correct it.	11%
12	I am afraid that my language teacher intentionally corrects my mistakes in front of the class that will make me shy.	9%
24	ESP class moves so quickly I worry about getting left behind.	26%
16	Even if I am well prepared for ESP class, I feel anxious about it.	20%
15	I often feel like not going to my ESP class.	11%
Skill-related anxiety		
19	I care much about my pronunciation and accent in speaking class.	71%
25	I worry much about my grammar in writing class.	69%
18	I start to panic when I have to speak without preparation.	66%
20	I think that I cannot write the vocabulary in listening class.	66%
17	I feel uneasy when I am not familiar with the words/the topic in the listening audio.	63%
23	I am afraid that I would incorrectly answer the reading questions.	60%
27	I think I don't know how to write a composition in English.	46%
22	I feel nervous when I don't know what to do with the reading text and the questions.	43%
26	I don't get enough time to do the task in writing class and feel overwhelmed by the number of rules I have learnt to write in a foreign language.	26%
21	I feel overwhelmed by the number of rules I have to learn to speak English.	23%

Table 2 the result of FLE Questionnaire

Item no.	Items	Responses (%)
Social		
28	The teacher is supportive.	100%
29	The teacher is friendly.	100%
32	There is a good atmosphere.	100%
30	ESP class is a positive environment.	97%
31	I am motivated to actively involved in the classroom activities.	91%
33	We can help each other in ESP class.	97%
34	We form a tight group.	97%
Private		
37	I think learning ESP is fun.	100%
38	We laugh a lot in ESP class.	100%
36	I enjoy the ESP class.	97%
35	In class, I feel proud of my accomplishments.	86%

enjoyment is seemingly caused mainly by the teachers' role. As it can also be seen in the findings, that the respondents also stated the same that the teachers play crucial role in class. These findings are pretty similar to those in a study reported by Jin & Zhang (2018). The respondents stated that the teachers' involvement in the process of learning activities is pretty significant to the emergence of the enjoyment in the classroom.

In addition, the finding supports the statement of Li et al. (2017), stating that teachers' ability to create more attractive and establish good atmosphere during the teaching learning process will trigger the emergence of the FLE in classroom. This also supported by the evidence of the finding in private factors in which this factor originating from the students' own thoughts and feelings showed from the result of questionnaire that since the teachers is capable to create more attractive and establish good atmosphere, the student seems to be happy and enjoy the teaching learning process (shown in item 37 and 38). Hence, students experience FLE during the teaching learning process as what is stated by Dewaele and MacIntyre (2016) stating that the feeling of happiness is described as the enjoyment.

The other factors observed in this study is considered to highly contributed to the emergence of the FLA in classroom. It can be noted that all items get above 90% response from the respondents. However, there is a factor having response of approximately 80% from the respondents; it is regarding to the accomplishments (item 35). Therefore, the teacher needs to boost students' confidence to their feeling toward the accomplishments achieved

In the first place, it is generally believed (assumed) that there will be gap between the emergence of foreign language anxiety and foreign language enjoyment. The assumption is that when the FLA emerges in the classroom, the FLE will be absent, or at least, it will only slightly emerge. Conversely, when the FLE emerges in the classroom, the FLA will be absent. However, the finding of this study showed that both of the foreign language anxiety and foreign language enjoyment emerge at the same time.

The interesting thing happened in this study is that the result of the foreign language enjoyment questionnaire shows higher score than the foreign language anxiety. This foreign language enjoyment is mostly caused by the involvement of the teacher in creating and establishing the atmosphere of teaching learning process. In addition, what made the students enjoy the process of learning in the class was the teachers' help. This help could be in the form of asking

questions whether they understood the lesson privately, or re-explaining the topic or lesson the students have not understood. Therefore, even the students experienced the anxiety, they also felt happy (signaling that enjoyment is also experienced by the students). Thus, it is interesting to emphasis here that the teachers who are able and willingly to help their students could generate good and positive atmosphere in the class. This was also proven that the point within the FLE questionnaire the item related to classroom atmosphere received apparently high score. So, it can be seen that the students also sustained enjoyment even though they experienced anxiety during the ESP class.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Conclusion

The results of the study show that both foreign language anxiety (FLA) and enjoyment (FLE) occurred during teaching leaning process in ESP classroom. It means that the occurrence of FLA does not necessarily eliminate FLE, and vice versa. The data analysis shows that there are some causes leading the occurrence of this FLA and FLE. Among those causes, the most frequent cause experienced by students was anxiety related to classroom.

The most frequent cause of FLA experienced by the student was that they were afraid their classmate and teacher could not understand their English speaking. The others frequent cause that belongs to learner induced and skill-specific anxiety are their concern regarding their pronunciation and accent when speaking in English and their concern that the other students can speak English better that they do.

The most frequent causes of FLE expressed by students were excellent atmosphere that was created by the teacher and the support that came from the teachers. It means that the involvement of teacher to create FLE experienced by the students is significantly important. Teachers who are able to create fun and interesting learning leading to an excellent atmosphere for students in the class, and teacher who are always ready to help students when facing learning problems or difficulties during teaching learning process are the key to trigger the enjoyment (FLE).

From those aforementioned categories, it can be said that the students' FLA occurred when students requires to speak in English. It is due to the situation and condition faced by the students during teaching learning process in ESP classroom. However, teacher

can help students so that they do not only focus themselves on the anxiety (FLA) they experience and giving more effort to also focus on their enjoyment (FLE) in classroom, or at least the teacher can balance between those two, FLA and FLE.

Suggestion

This study only focused on the most frequent causes of FLA and FLE experience by the student when joining ESP classroom. Due to the limitations of the present study, the following recommendations should be considered for further research. Since it only focuses to reveal the most frequent causes of FLA and FLE occurrence in classroom, the future researcher could aim at investigating how the students balance their anxiety (FLA) and enjoyment (FLE). Moreover, future researcher could also investigate how this FLA and FLE correlate with the students' achievement in ESP classroom.

REFERENCES

- Aguilar, A. P. (2013). Emotions as Learning Enhancers of Foreign Language Learning Motivation. *Profile: Issues in Teachers' Professional Development*, 15(1), 109–124.
- Aragão, R. (2011). Beliefs and emotions in foreign language learning. *System*, 39(3), 302–313. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2011.07.003>
- Booth, R. J., & Penebaker, J. W. (2018). Fear and anxiety. In M. Lewis, J. M. Haviland-Jones, & L. F. Barrett (Eds.), *The Function of Emotions: When and Why Emotions Help Us*. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-77619-4_2
- Brown, H. Douglas. (2007). Principles of Language Learning and Teaching. In *Language* (Vol. 57, Issue 3). <https://doi.org/10.2307/414380>
- Brown, H.D., & Arnold, J. (2000). A map of the terrain. In J. Arnold (Ed.), *Affect in Language Learning* (Vol. 34). <https://doi.org/10.2307/3587794>
- Dewaele, J.-M. (2015). *On Emotions in Foreign Language Learning and Use*. June.
- Dewaele, J.-M., & MacIntyre, P. D. (2014). The two faces of Janus? Anxiety and enjoyment in the foreign language classroom. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching*, 4(2), 237–274. <https://doi.org/10.14746/sslIt.2014.4.2.5>
- Dewaele, J., & Alfawzan, M. (2018). Does the effect of enjoyment outweigh that of anxiety in foreign language performance? *8*(1), 21–45. <https://doi.org/10.14746/sslIt.2018.8.1.2>
- Dewaele, J. M. (2007). The effect of multilingualism, sociobiographical, and situational factors on communicative anxiety and foreign language anxiety of mature language learners. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, 11(4), 391–409. <https://doi.org/10.1177/13670069070110040301>
- Dewaele, J., & MacIntyre, P. (2016). *Foreign Language Enjoyment and Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety. The right and left feet of FL learning/ ? April*. <https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783095360-010>
- Elahi Shirvan, M., & Taherian, T. (2018). Longitudinal examination of university students' foreign language enjoyment and foreign language classroom anxiety in the course of general English: latent growth curve modeling. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 0(0), 1–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2018.1441804>
- Gardner, R. C., & MacIntyre, P. D. (1993). *On the Measurement of Affective Variables in Second Language Learning*. June, 157–194.
- Gregresen, T., MacIntyre, P. D., & Olson, T. (2017). Do you see what I feel? An idiodynamic assessment of expert and peer's reading of nonverbal language anxiety cues. In *New insights into language anxiety: Theory, research and educational implications* (pp. 110–134). UK: Multilingual Matters.
- Hidayati, T. (2018). Student Language Anxiety in Learning English (A survey to non-English Major students in rural area). *IJELTAL (Indonesian Journal of English Language Teaching and Applied Linguistics)*, 2(2), 95. <https://doi.org/10.21093/ijeltal.v2i2.55>
- Hockenbury, D. H., & Hockenbury, S. E. (2010). *Discovering Psychology*. Worth Publisher.
- Horwitz, E.K., et al. (1986). Foreign Language Classroom Anxiety. *The Modern Language Journal*.
- Horwitz, E. (2001). *Language Anxiety and Achievement. Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*. 112–126.
- Imai, Y. (2010). Emotions in SLA: New insights from collaborative learning for an EFL classroom. *Modern Language Journal*, 94(2), 278–292. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.2010.01021.x>
- Jialing, W. (2019). The Relationship Between Learners' Personality Traits and EFL Learning. *Sino-US English Teaching*, 16(4), 135–142. <https://doi.org/10.17265/1539-8072/2019.04.001>
- Jin, Y., & Zhang, L. J. (2018). International Journal of Bilingual Education and The dimensions of foreign language classroom enjoyment and their effect on foreign language achievement. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 0(0), 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2018.1526253>

- Li, C., Jiang, G., & Dewaele, J. M. (2018). Understanding Chinese high school students' Foreign Language Enjoyment: Validation of the Chinese version of the Foreign Language Enjoyment scale. *System, 76*, 183–196. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.system.2018.06.004>
- Lu, Z., & Liu, M. (2011). Foreign Language Anxiety and Strategy Use: A Study with Chinese Undergraduate EFL Learners. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research, 2*(6), 1298–1305. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.2.6.1298-1305>
- MacIntyre, P. D. (1999). *Language Anxiety: A Review of the Research for Language Teachers* (D. J. Young (ed.)).
- MacIntyre, P. D., & Vincze, L. (2017). Positive and negative emotions underlie motivation for L2 learning. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching, 7*(1), 61–88. <https://doi.org/10.14746/sslit.2017.7.1.4>
- MacIntyre, P., & Gregersen, T. (2012). Anxiety and Other Emotions in Language Learning. *Psychology for Language Learning, 2012*, 103–118.
- MacIntyre, Peter D., & Mercer, S. (2014). Introducing positive psychology to SLA. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching, 4*(2), 153–172. <https://doi.org/10.14746/sslit.2014.4.2.2>
- Marwan, A. (2016). Malaysian journal of ELT research. *Malaysian Journal of ELT Research, 3*(1), 19. <http://journals.melta.org.my/index.php/majer/article/view/196/106>
- Pekrun, R. (2014). *Emotions and Learning*.
- Pekrun, R., Goetz, T., Titz, W., & Perry, R. P. (2002). Academic emotions in students' self-regulated learning and achievement: A program of qualitative and quantitative research. *Educational Psychologist, 37*(2), 91–105. https://doi.org/10.1207/S15326985EP3702_4
- Pishghadam, R., Zabetipour, M., & Aminzadeh, A. (2016). Examining emotions in English language learning classes: A case of EFL emotions. *Issues in Educational Research, 26*(3), 508–527.
- Saito, K. (2018). *Motivation, Emotion, Learning Experience, and Second Language Comprehensibility Development in Classroom Settings/ : A Cross-Sectional and Longitudinal Study. Room 334*, 1–35. <https://doi.org/10.1111/lang.12297>
- Scovel, T. (1978). The Effect of Affect On Foreign Language Learning: A Review of The Anxiety Research. *Language Learning, 28*.
- Teimouri, Y., Goetze, J., & Plonsky, L. (2019). SECOND LANGUAGE ANXIETY and ACHIEVEMENT. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition, 41*(2), 363–387. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0272263118000311>
- Tyng, C. M., Amin, H. U., Saad, M. N. M., & Malik, A. S. (2017). The influences of emotion on learning and memory. *Frontiers in Psychology, 8*(AUG). <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2017.01454>
- White, M. A., & Murray, A. S. (2015). *Evidence-Based Approaches in Positive Education* (I. Boniwell (ed.)).
- Yassin, A. A., & Razak, N. A. (2018). Investigating Foreign Language Learning Anxiety Among Yemeni University EFL Learners: A Theoretical Framework Development. *English Language Teaching, 11*(10), 38. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v11n10p38>
- Zhang, R., & Zhong, J. (2012). *The Hindrance of Doubt/ : Causes of Language Anxiety. 2*(3), 27–33. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ijel.v2n3p27>

