

Teacher's Beliefs and Practice Toward the Teaching Reading Strategies to Foster Students' Critical Thinking

Rahmaniah Oktaviah*, Johannes Ananto Prayogo, M. Misbahul Amri

Department of English, Universitas Negeri Malang

rahmaniaoktav@gmail.com*

*Corresponding Author

ARTICLE INFO	ABSTRACT
<p>Article history:</p> <p>Received 20/11/2020 Approved 4/5/2021</p> <hr/> <p>Keywords:</p> <p>Teacher's belief Strategies Critical thinking</p>	<p>Abstract: This is a case study designed to investigate the Advanced Reading teacher's beliefs in teaching reading and their practice, especially by involving critical thinking. It is obtained that the teacher believes in several strategies in teaching reading, which are case study, group discussion, and presentation of the text's summary. While for the teaching practice the teacher implements several strategies which are group and classroom discussion, presentation and questioning, summarizing, and also storytelling. Some of the strategies are congruent with the teacher's beliefs and some others are not in line with the teacher's beliefs.</p>

INTRODUCTION

English has been an international language in global communication in every country and it becomes the need of ESL/EFL learners to develop the knowledge of English. In order to understand and be able to communicate with people around the world, EFL learners are expected to master four skills of English as the foundation of learning. Focusing on EFL learners in Indonesia, some are less motivated in reading especially English text. Although reading belongs to one of the receptive skills, students need to improve it because it is one of important knowledge sources. Therefore, teachers should understand what kind of teaching reading strategy they use to teach the students. Anderson (1999) has mentioned six strategies that can be used in teaching reading, namely: activate prior knowledge, cultivate vocabulary, teach for comprehension, increase reading rate, verify reading strategies, and evaluate progress (ACTIVE). In this case, the teachers can assist the students by encouraging them to adjust the reading strategies dealing with the reading purposes and types. Besides, According to Babbit (2002), there are several strategies considered to be effective that are comprehension monitoring, cooperative learning, graphic organizer, question-and-answer, question generating strategy, the summary making about the text, and story structure. Besides, Riswanto, et al. (2014) has conducted an experimental study indicating that KWL strategy was effective in improving the students' reading comprehension achievement. Above all, every teacher has different perceptions and opinions about the best strategy of teaching reading. Thus, the strategy of teaching reading varies in each level of education with different purposes, especially in the context of EFL classrooms.

In implementing teaching reading strategy, teachers must have their specific to take into account as reading is a mediator, such as reading can be used as a mediator of other skills related to the 21st century skills to foster. One of those skills is critical thinking skills in reading in order to make the students able to evaluate the information or ideas to decide what to accept and what to believe. Vaseghi, et al. (2012) have stated that Critical thinking is "...a reasonable reflective thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe and what to do...". In other words, critical thinking is a process of analyzing, synthesizing, and also evaluating information to guide someone's beliefs and actions. Some scholars have conducted research on the importance of teaching critical thinking in ESL/EFL context (Atkinson, 1997; Davison, 1998; Day, 2003; Kubota, 1999). The need of teaching critical thinking has been the concern of the researchers as well as teachers in the pedagogical area, especially in reading. Tung and Chang (2009) have investigated the efficacy of developing critical thinking in literature reading through several strategies, namely: reading comprehension pop quizzes, learning log, group presentations, guided in-class discussion with "Socratic questioning skills" adopted from Paul and Elder (2007), and individual essay-question reports. The findings have indicated that literature reading is helpful in improving students' critical thinking while students' English proficiency do not affect their critical thinking. Another study conducted by Choy and Cheah (2009) indicates that the teachers perceive that they believe that critical thinking will provide the intellectual stimuli and the students who have critical thinking are able to explain ideas and concepts in their own words. From the previous studies, it can be concluded that teaching critical thinking can be delivered through reading activities and it has a significant effect on students' way of thinking. Students at university level are ones who are believed to apply critical thinking through reading as they have passed secondary level of education and those critical thinking skills are essentials for Higher Order Thinking skills. It is clearly shown in Bloom's Taxonomy (1956) that there are

six levels in a successive hierarchy, namely: knowledge, comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation. Based on the six levels, according to Huit (1998: 2), "...the evaluation level focuses on making assessment or judgment based on an analysis of a statement or proposition...". It can be said that critical thinking is in the evaluation part. Therefore, it is the challenge of the reading teachers to integrate the concept of critical thinking with the reading strategy they choose to achieve the goal. In this case, lecturers who attempt to implement critical thinking in their reading classes must have conceptions of critical thinking in their minds.

Language teachers' beliefs toward the teaching strategies play an important role in their classroom practices. Thus, the decision of using the teaching tools, such as the materials, the strategies, the media, the procedures, and other things related to classroom activities, are influenced by the beliefs. According to Khader (2012: 74), teachers' beliefs can be defined as "a set of ideas rooted in the psychological and mental content of the teacher and play a central role in guiding his/her teaching behavior". It means that a teacher is responsible for designing classroom activities which are based on his/her beliefs of particular strategies. Teachers' cognition as well as the relation between teachers' beliefs and practice have been recently the focus of research in English Language Teaching (Alisaari and Heikkola, 2017; Bamanger and Gashan, 2014; Borg, 2003; Rusmawati et al., 2018). The practice can be observed clearly in the classroom, but the teacher's beliefs cannot be seen directly. "The only way to identify the teachers' beliefs is by getting the teachers to tell what their beliefs are, or to produce work in which their beliefs are implied" (Borg, in Birello, 2012: 89). In order to know whether the beliefs are reflected on their practice in class, some studies on teachers' beliefs and practices were conducted recently in EFL classrooms context which has indicated various results. Shinde and Karekatti (2012) have investigated pre-service teachers' beliefs and practice of teaching English to young learners and the result has shown that there are consistencies between the teachers' beliefs and their classroom practices. Kuzburoska (2011) also has found that the beliefs that were identified as congruent with their practices are the implementation of: *skills-based approach, emphasizing vocabulary, reading aloud, translation, and discussion*. Besides, Richardson et al. (1991) have conducted a case study to determine the relationship between teachers' beliefs and practices in reading comprehension and the results have revealed that the beliefs of the sample relate to their practices in teaching reading comprehension. However, some previous studies have also highlighted some inconsistencies between teachers' beliefs and their practices (Ertmer, 2005). According to Ertmer, it is usually due to contextual factors that prevent teachers from translating their beliefs into practice. Negueruela-Azarola (2011) has also stated that actions are not always in accord with beliefs. Then the studies of Karavas-Doukas (1996) and Sato and Kleinsasser (1999) have indicated that even though teachers were positive in their beliefs toward communicative language teaching (CLT), only limited CLT was evident in their teaching practice.

In relation with the miscellaneous strategies of teaching reading with the demand of integrating critical thinking to demonstrate the students' understanding, language teachers have to build up their beliefs toward teaching strategy which accommodates their beliefs reflecting their practices and actions in the classroom. Focusing on ELT at university level, there are numerous subjects that are closely related to the critical thinking skills, and one of them is *Advanced Reading* as it requires students to analyze and elaborate ideas based on what they read. In order to achieve the goal of teaching critical thinking through reading, teachers' beliefs on teaching reading strategy that come up from their minds need articulating. Therefore, this research is conducted to investigate the teachers' beliefs in teaching reading and their practice of teaching which reflects their beliefs on the strategy of teaching reading, especially by involving critical thinking.

METHOD

In this study, a case study research design was conducted in order to explore and understand the issue in teaching reading by doing in-depth investigation into the belief, opinion, description, experience, behavior of the subject being researched. Case study method is used since it enables researchers to examine the data within a specific context. In this study, the researchers have observed a teacher as the subject in conjunction with her teaching *Advanced Reading*. The case identified was the beliefs of the teacher toward the teaching reading strategies in fostering critical thinking. In conducting the research, which was qualitative, the researchers have to collect the authentic data. As noted by Latief (2013), in order to get the authentic data, the researchers must take the data from the data sources exactly when the sources are in their natural setting. The data therefore, was taken from the subject in the whole process from the beginning until the last activity to gain the authentic data.

Based on the types of case studies, the researchers chose a descriptive case study as the findings would be described based on the natural phenomena and the data would be presented as they occur, in conjunction with the teachers' beliefs and the teaching reading practice in fostering students' critical thinking. In case study, the researcher obtained a deep understanding of phenomenon, events, people, or organization known as "thick description". Geertz (1973:10) has asserted about the concept of thick description that the researcher faces "a multiplicity of complex conceptual structures and many of them superimposed upon or knotted into one another, which are at once strange, irregular, and inexplicit, which he must contrive somehow first to grasp and then to render". In other words, the researcher needs the informants who understand well about the case in which the researcher is interested in and then generate findings. This can be done by interviewing informants and observing the whole process until the process of writing journals about the information. Therefore, the researcher began with a descriptive theory to support the description of the phenomenon or story. In addition, this research was qualitative since it placed primary emphasis on saturation, which is to obtain comprehensive understanding by continuing observation until there is no new information acquired (Miles & Huberman, 1994). Then, the result of this research

would be described descriptively in the form of words, which means the data is presented by providing all of the information as well as the opinions and theories concerning the teaching and learning process in involving critical thinking in reading.

RESULTS

Teacher's Beliefs toward the Teaching Reading Strategies in Fostering Students' Critical Thinking

The answer of this problem was obtained from the questionnaire and the interview to the subject of this research who is an *Advanced Reading* teacher who teaches the undergraduate students in the fourth semester. The questionnaire required the teacher to show her beliefs toward the strategies she uses in teaching reading by integrating critical thinking in her teaching and learning process. Besides, it consisted of the questions about the factors affecting her beliefs. It was then elaborated through the interview questions.

Teaching Reading Strategies to Foster Students' Critical Thinking

Based on the first statement in the questionnaire that is "*I always use strategies that can foster students' critical thinking in reading, especially in Advanced Reading*", it is shown that the teacher agreed that she always uses strategies that can foster students' critical thinking, especially in *Advanced Reading* course. According to her, integrating critical thinking in reading is very important because actually students are thinking and reading at the same time to get some knowledge. She believed that students need to analyze the reading material and judge the information they get in order to stimulate their thinking skills. Thus, in the second statement in the questionnaire she strongly agreed that she believes in particular strategies in teaching reading involving critical thinking. Even though she stated that she cannot specify her belief on particular strategies, she explained that she always implements strategies that make them analyze why or how something happens and share their opinions toward cases or events discussed in the text. Therefore, she believed that the reading materials should be relatable to the students' life.

As critical thinking consisted of several skills, the integration of those skills is necessary to consider, too. In the questionnaire and the interview with the teacher, there was a statement about the beliefs toward the critical thinking skills which are reasoning, analyzing, evaluating, problem-solving, and decision making. The teacher strongly agreed on the integration of those skills in teaching *Advanced Reading*. She assumed that integrating critical thinking means applying the critical thinking skills in the teaching and learning process. According to the teacher, we cannot separate one of those parts from another. For instance, if the students just do evaluation without analyzing it would be difficult. Therefore, she believed that those skills are important to be implemented in teaching *Advanced Reading*. As mentioned in the interview, the teacher had implemented several strategies that she believed to be helpful in fostering students' critical thinking skills. One example was case study, in which the students analyzed a case based on the provided text or picture until they could decide which side of the issues they believed in. Another example was discussion. In discussion, the students could be free in expressing their ideas and understanding each other's perspective. Besides, the teacher also believed that presentation and questioning among the students are helpful to foster their critical thinking in reading. According to the teacher, if the students get used to reading, they would also get used to thinking critically since we cannot understand what we read without thinking. Even though students are not interested in reading books recently, the teacher kept trying to make them willing to read by giving them different kinds of reading material and reading tasks.

Another aspect to be considered in fostering students' critical thinking in reading is the stage of Higher Order Thinking Skills. Based on the level of thinking proposed in Bloom's Taxonomy (1956), the critical thinking skills belong to the Higher Order Thinking Skills. Then, this aspect was also included in the questionnaire and the interview. The teacher agreed to the statement that the stages of HOTS can help the students to develop their critical thinking in reading and also in other skills. According to her, university students are required to implement all stages of HOTS and they are now supposed to be in the evaluating or synthesizing stage. Therefore, in reading skill especially in advanced level, the students should be able to implement those stages because it was also related to the critical thinking skills that are integrated in the reading tasks in her class. She also explained in the interview that from analyzing until synthesizing stages are the stages she believed can foster students' critical thinking in *Advanced Reading*. The teacher stated that she wanted the students to be able to produce something from what they read. Even though she taught reading, she believed that other skills can also be integrated as language skills are related to each other so that the product can be in the form of writing or presentation. In her perception, the activities of making products from reading could be done in those stages and the product would be in the synthesizing stage. Therefore, the teacher could assess the students' progress in reading.

Based on the data obtained from the questionnaire and the interview above, it can be concluded that the teacher believed that critical thinking skills need to be integrated in teaching reading by considering the critical thinking skills and Higher Order Thinking Skills stages in implementing the strategies. The teacher has beliefs on particular strategies that can foster students' critical thinking.

The strategies are case studies, discussion, presentation of the text's summary, and also product presentation. In addition, the teacher believed that by giving different kinds of reading material and reading tasks would help the students to enjoy reading and make them get used to thinking critically in reading.

The Practice of Teaching Reading to Foster Students' Critical Thinking

The researcher started to join the class in the 10th meeting of the *Advanced Reading* course. In the first observation, the class had come to the topic of non-fiction and fiction. For fiction, the teacher used classic novels for the reading material, while for the non-fiction, she used articles for the reading material. At the beginning of the lesson, the teacher continued the material of the previous meeting which was about non-fiction. Both the teacher and the students had interaction by questioning and answering related to non-fiction. However, some students seemed not interested in the explanation because they still talked to each other or did not really pay attention to the teacher's explanation at the beginning of the lesson. Therefore, the teacher needed to give stimulation to make them focus.

After several minutes of explanation, the teacher asked about a topic which was about the use of the internet as a need nowadays. There were 2 students who answered the teacher's question by sharing their opinion toward the given topic. The first student answered that they could easily find any information as internet is accessible. Then the second student answered that the internet could give either knowledge or entertainment with various social media and platforms that can be found just in one click. After that, the teacher continued by asking the students to read the example of non-fiction text in their textbook (*Advanced Reading Power* by Beatrice Mikulecky and Linda Jeffries) in around 10 minutes. The students were also given chance to ask if they found any difficulties. In the field notes of the observation, it can be seen that all of the students did the teacher's instruction to read the text and found out what is being discussed in the text. After the students had read the text, they were asked to answer the teacher's questions related to the text. Firstly, the teacher asked about the parts of the text which was article. Then, the teacher stimulated the students to answer about what was being discussed such as: *do you agree with the author? Why?, Why do you think it could happen?, What would you do if you were in the writer's position?*, etc.

The students were active to answer the question. Therefore, the teacher did not only choose one of them but also gave another chance to others who raised their hands. Here, the students got the answers from many perceptions as they were allowed to give their own opinions. In this classroom discussion, there were three students who gave their opinions critically. It was shown when they had a good reason of their opinion and they raised several vital questions related to the topic discussed. Besides, they were able to give judgements based on the proof. However, the other students who were passive and did not give an opinion seemed to pay attention to the others' opinions. The teacher sometimes pointed to the students who tended to be passive or did not pay attention. Therefore, some of the students just gave the common answers. After finishing discussing the newspaper, then the students did the worksheet in their textbook related to the text.

Next, the teacher asked the students to find out an article related to issues in English Language Teaching in a group of 4 students. All of them were given time to read the article and then they had to discuss the issue being raised. Each student should state his/ her own position or opinion on the issue. Then, the other students were asked to give arguments based on their own position. Each group had to have the leader who was responsible for any participation in that group and made sure that all of the group members had raised their opinion. When all of the students were having group discussion, the teacher went around the class to supervise all groups. The researcher also observed the process of classroom discussion by coming to the groups and sometimes followed the teacher when she stayed in a group. From my observation, the teacher seemed to assist the students who had difficulties in vocabulary meaning and stimulate the students by giving several critical questions to their opinions such as "*if you think grammar is the most important component that should be mastered by young learners, how would you teach your students the grammar when they still lack of vocabularies?*" "*how would you make your students have a good pronunciation in role-play? In doing role-play what might be their focus?*" and many other kinds of questions in each group. After they finished the discussion, the teacher asked the conclusion of what they had gotten from the discussion of the article. At the end of the meeting, the teacher asked the students with the same group to bring one classical novel for each group for the next meeting.

Then the 2nd observation which was the 11th meeting, the researcher joined the teacher to the class and sat in the backward seat. The teacher reviewed the previous material which was about giving opinions on an article. Some students looked enthusiast in answering the teacher's question about the previous materials. After the brief review on the previous material, the teacher continued to the next material which was the fiction reading material. In this meeting, the teacher guided the students to do a book review and chapter review. Firstly, the teacher asked the students to have a look on their textbook page 18 and then page 24. Then the teacher raised a question about what the students liked the most from that chapter and why they liked it. The students mentioned some parts of the chapter that made them interested and the reasons for their opinions on the chapter. Next, the teacher gave several explanations and stimulated the students by having interaction through the provided power point. The teacher showed 4 covers of novel. The first is *Enchantress* by James Maxwell. Then the teacher asked what came across the students' mind when they saw the picture of that

novel cover. One student answered that he thought it might be a horror or mystery novel, since the picture was a mysterious man standing and facing the opposite side wearing long robe with hoodie. While another student answered that it might be an assassination story and the man who was standing was a murderer. There was also a student who said that the story must be sad as the situation was gloomy. Then the last student answered that it might tell about the meaning of life in the historical era or the history of ancient mythology as he saw there were Greek letters. Then, the teacher continued showing the second novel entitled *Memoirs of Geisha* by Arthur Golden. With the same questions, almost all of the students answered that it was about the life of Geisha. The teacher then asked the students what they know about Geisha. The answers were almost the same such as: *Geisha is a woman who serves the guests or Geisha is a woman who works by taking care of someone.*

Then, the third novel was *The Host* by Stephenie Meyer. The teacher asked the students about what they could infer from the cover and there were also different answers from the students. The first student answered that as there was a sharp stare of a woman, it might tell about the sacrifice of a woman in struggling for her children or her right. The second student answered that as the cover was a picture of an eye and the eye looked unique, she might be a kind of alien who wants to destroy this earth. The last student answered that from the cover, she inferred that there might be a deep meaning the writer wants to express and she thought that the cover had nothing related to the plot of the story in that novel. The last novel was *A Great and Terrible Beauty* by Libba Bray. With the similar question of the previous novels, the students had different opinions on the cover. Some stated that the cover picture is related to the title which was beauty, therefore the story must be about a beautiful woman who gets something both good and bad because of her beauty. There was also a student who answered that the story might tell about a beautiful woman who people think is a good and kind person but the fact is she is wicked and cunning. While the other students thought that the cover was not interesting.

From the interactions on pictures of book covers, it can be seen that the students were attracted to think and guess by giving their own opinion. After having questions and answers toward the cover of novel, the teacher back to the power point slides and explained to the students related to the steps of reading. According to the teacher's explanation, the most important point in reading was the question-and-answer section. In reading, the students had to re-enact the questions in mind and establish their own opinion based on what they read. Therefore, the students were asked to explore more on what they read. The teacher then asked the students to show the novel they had brought. As there were 5 groups in that class, there were 5 novels to be read and discussed. The representation of each group had to come forward to consult their novels. After all of the group representations came forward, the teacher gave several instructions of what the students should do for the next meeting. The students had to divide the chapters for each member in a group. Each member of the group had to read the chapters they had gotten. Then, they would have a discussion about the story they read in the following week. The teacher also reminded them that they would have to retell the story in the chapters they got

The next observation was the 12th meeting of the course. The teacher as usual started the class by reviewing the previous material and reminding the students of their assignment which was reading the chapters of the novel. All of the students said that they had finished reading the chapters they got. The teacher asked them to sit in their groups and this took quite a long time since the students were talking to each other until the teacher asked them to be ready. Then, they came to the first activity which was discussing what each member got from the chapter they had read. The teacher gave time to share the chapters in groups then they had to raise opinions and questions as well. They were also asked to analyze the issue being raised in the novel then give the judgment of the issues or problems. In order to make sure that all members got a chance to participate in the questioning and giving opinions session, the teacher asked one member to be the note taker to note any participation. They were also given chances to ask the teacher if they found any problems in discussion.

Here, the teacher made the classroom atmosphere as comfortable as possible by giving a space to the students with the comfortable seat arrangement. The teacher asked the students to feel free doing their discussion, as long as they discussed topics related to the novel. The teacher went around the class and sometimes took a seat near the students. From my observation of this activity, the students seemed to be interested in sharing what they got. The researcher listened to the opinions of some students that the researcher found interesting. One group talked about *The Time Machine* when the character was changed, and some members gave some statements such as "where did the time machine come at the first time? Was it like a hidden treasure?" "I don't think humans need a time machine; it is such a troublesome if we use time machine. Just let everything be as it is" "how come the time traveller cannot be seen by their relatives?". Another group was discussing *The Phantom of the Opera* and they were having discussions like "there must be something wrong with Joseph that the Phantom killed him" "is the opera always related to something mystic? Because I think all of big performances need a big thing to help, by a mystic energy, for example". Almost all members of the groups had participation in the discussion as can be seen in the field notes based on the observation. Their opinions and questions were interesting as some of them were imaginative and thought out of the box. Even though not all of the students showed critical thinking in discussing the chapters, some of them proved that the opinions and judgements indicated the critical ideas. At the end of the meeting, the teacher asked the students to write their own analysis on the whole novel shared by the group. For the homework, the students were asked to make a summary of the novel in a group and they had to prepare retelling the chapters they got for the next week.

After class, the researcher asked the teacher's permission to have a brief interview about the reading activity that day and the teacher agreed. Therefore, we had a little conversation toward the teaching and learning process. The teacher stated that the discussion was

very important not only to check their understanding on what they read, but also to stimulate them to think critically on what they read. The teacher expected that from that activity, the students would be able to stand on their position on particular issues related to the story and produce an opinion or judgement on others' position. However, according to the teacher, it was still hard to make the passive or unconfident students express their opinions. Thus, the teacher always monitored the students especially the passive students to make sure they got turn to participate.

Next, the 4th observation was in the 13th meeting of the course. The teacher explained their activity or task on that day that was storytelling. The students were asked to retell the chapters they had gotten to the teacher individually. Each of them had to come forward in turn, while the others were asked to make a synopsis of the novel. There were 2 sessions for the storytelling: (1) the students retold the first two chapters they got and (2) the students retold the second two (or more) chapters they got. Therefore, that activity was done in 3 meetings. The teacher allowed me to sit near the teacher's seat, so that the researcher could listen and see clearly to get the data of the teacher and students' interaction. For this meeting, the teacher started the storytelling from the students who wanted to volunteer for the first turn. The first student came forward and retold the two chapters he read which was from a novel *The Phantom of the Opera*. The teacher then gave several questions related to the story. The question was "do you think something we called ghost really exist?" then the student answered that he believed that any living things and non-living things do exist and they must have their own role in this world. Then the teacher asked again, "what about in your real life, are you interested in watching an opera?" then the student answered, "not really. I would like to watch a concert than an opera as it brings the story of something that is quite familiar so it can make me feel bored." After that, the teacher called another student for the next turn. The next student had a story of *Alice in the Wonderland*. He told almost in detail about the chapters he read. After he finished the storytelling, the teacher then gave him questions related to the story such as "do you think that the King's decision is wise enough?", "do you think the knight takes sides?" then the teacher continued to ask the reason for his answer. The student also gave the reasonable answer of his opinion. Then the next turn got a novel entitled *The Scarlet Letter*. The questions from the teacher were "do you think that they have a good relationship?" "in your opinion, does the character have problem before?". Then the other novels presented and discussed in this meeting were *The Wind in the Willows* and also *The Time Machine*. For each storyteller, the teacher always gave the questions related to the culture, behavior, beliefs, action, and many other aspects told in the novel. The teacher did not only ask the *what* but explore more on the *how* and *why* based on the students' own opinions. The teacher stimulated the students to find out something that was not implicitly told in the novel and something that might come across their minds when reading the novels. Thus, as can be seen in the observation, the students had various answers and insights toward the characters, cultures, even the cases in the novel. At the end of the class, the teacher reminded the students to prepare for the next storytelling in the next meeting.

For the 14th and 15th meeting of the course, the teacher continued the previous material with the similar activities that were storytelling and questioning and answering from the chapters. However, in these two meetings, the teacher did not ask the students who were not performing to do another task but made a classroom discussion based on the chapters being told. The teacher asked the students to come forward and retell the parts of the novel they had gotten. When each student came forward to retell the chapters, the other students were paying attention to him/ her and after the performer had finished the story, the teacher allowed them to raise any questions to the performer. Besides, the teacher also gave several questions related to the novel. The last observation was in the 16th meeting of the course. In this meeting, the teacher reviewed the previous material related to fiction and non-fiction. After they had learned both fiction and non-fiction texts in the previous meetings, the teacher wanted to know their conception on the difference between fiction and non-fiction. Firstly, the teacher asked the students to have a look at their course book on page 12-13 and read the text there. After they finished reading, 3 students were asked to come forward one by one to tell the information they got from the text. Then, the teacher asked their opinions based on the information on the article, such as, "Is it relevant to our country? Why?", "What do you think about both opinions? Which one do you agree the most?", "Does the information in the article change your perspective towards postcard? Why?", etc. Several students seemed to be confused and doubted to answer. However, the teacher helped the students to probe their ideas by adding the simplified questions.

The Relationship between Teacher's beliefs and the Practice

Based on the observation of the teacher's practice in the teaching reading, it was indicated that there is a relationship between the teacher's beliefs and her practice. The teacher implemented strategies that she believed to be helpful in fostering students' critical thinking in reading. However, not all of the beliefs she had could be implemented in the class. As stated in the interview, there are factors that can affect her beliefs whether in building or in changing the beliefs. Those factors contributed to the teacher's practice in teaching reading. In other words, the teacher's beliefs that she had in her mind affected the teaching practice.

As can be seen in the field notes and observation guide, the teacher implemented cooperative learning strategy which was group discussion in the teaching reading. This strategy was implemented based on the belief she stated in the interview. The teacher tended to implement the Higher Order thinking Skills in the teaching reading through activities that can stimulate students to think critically based on her belief. As she was teaching *Advanced Reading*, critical thinking became her focus for the students. When the teacher asked

the students to have a group and classroom discussion, it means the teacher had already done it based on her beliefs. Other strategies such as questioning and answering strategy and storytelling were also implemented in accordance with her beliefs stated in the interview.

The relationship between teacher's beliefs and practice was not only the beliefs affected to the practice but also the practice affected the modification of teacher's beliefs. In the interview, the teacher stated that the practice of teaching reading might not always be appropriate to be implemented in her *Advanced Reading* class. As the teacher always does a reflection on her teaching, she would revise the strategies, materials, or media she used and modify her beliefs toward the teaching *Advanced Reading*. However, if the strategies can be effectively implemented and successfully achieve the goal, the teacher keeps implementing the strategies. It can be said that the reflection of the teaching practice brings the teacher to a new belief. Even though the teacher's beliefs could change due to the reflection of the teaching practice, the teacher still holds the same beliefs that she found effective and appropriate for her students in fostering their critical thinking. In conclusion, the teacher's beliefs and the teaching practice affect one another and cannot be separated as practice comes from belief and vice versa.

DISCUSSION

Teacher's Beliefs toward the Teaching Reading Strategies to Foster Students' Critical Thinking

The present research has revealed that the observed teacher believed in several strategies of teaching reading by integrating critical thinking. According to the teacher, reading involves the process of thinking which can make the readers understand about the context. We cannot separate reading with the thinking process since both are related each other. As the teacher's statement in the questionnaire, it revealed that the teacher always involves the process of critical thinking in teaching reading. She expected the students to be able to give response in the form of opinion, ideas, or even judgment to the reading materials. It is in accordance with Ziauddin's (2004) statement about the definition of reading that is a responsive process which involves recognition, interpretation, and perception of written or printed materials. In this case, the teacher's practice seen in the observation also indicated that the teacher implements strategies of teaching reading that can stimulate students to generate ideas based on the reading materials. This means that in the reading process the students not only interpret the meaning and the context of the reading material but also attempt to make a judgment based on their perception. However, the teacher acknowledged that not all of the students are confident enough to give judgment on the text or share opinions based on the text. It might happen because some of the students are afraid to make mistakes or lack confidence. Facing this problem, the teacher gives more focus on those students to encourage them to speak and sometimes she gives tasks in written form. Due to this fact, having belief on the strategy the teacher would implement to teach reading in integrating critical thinking is important in order to make the teaching and learning process efficient.

In forming beliefs toward the teaching strategies, the teacher has considered the concept of critical thinking and has stated her own reason of the integration of critical thinking. It was stated by the teacher that critical thinking skills are important for students to be developed since it helps the students to absorb well any information or knowledge they have got. She thought that students need to put themselves on something right for them. If the students are accustomed to be critical, they would be more careful in assimilating any reading source in this digital era. Therefore, the concept of critical thinking has to be understood earlier. This is also in accordance with Vaseghi, et al. (2012) who have quoted that Critical thinking is a reasonable reflective thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe and what to do. This means, the teacher has held the concept of critical thinking by understanding the importance of critical thinking skills. Hence, the teacher believed that critical thinking skills have to be integrated in reading through the strategies she believes would be appropriate for the students.

There are numerous strategies of teaching reading that can be implemented in the teaching and learning process. The teacher, therefore, has personal belief on the strategies that are applicable for her students to foster the students' critical thinking. As mentioned before, the main belief of the teacher is the students in this digital era not only read to find the literal meaning but also understand the whole context of the reading text until they can give opinion as well as judgment of what they have read. This is due to the fact that facing digital era is a big chance for students to gain more knowledge outside the educational program, while reading is one of the ways to connect students to other information and knowledge. It requires students as the readers to be a critical thinker so that they can distinguish which information should be accepted as need or otherwise.

Based on this point of view, the teacher believed on several reading strategies that leads her to the teaching practice. One example is classroom or group discussion. In the interview, the teacher stated that she frequently uses this strategy to teach *Advanced Reading* as she can build the students' knowledge regarding the topic or phenomena being discussed in the text. Here, activating students' prior knowledge is important to make students able to draw a conclusion based on what they have read and what they have known. This is similar to Anderson (1999) who has advocated six strategies that can be used in teaching reading, namely: activate prior knowledge, cultivate vocabulary, teach for comprehension, increase reading rate, verify reading strategies, and evaluate progress (ACTIVE). However, not all of those strategies are used by the teacher since the teacher tended to use activating prior knowledge for discussion.

As can be seen in the observation, activating students' prior knowledge about the reading topic seemed to be helpful for the students so that they can be more confident in sharing ideas. Therefore, before having group or classroom discussion, the teacher usually gives several questions related to the reading topics in order to activate students' prior knowledge.

Another strategy that the teacher believed to be effective in fostering students' critical thinking in reading is group presentation. The teacher stated that she sometimes asks the students to make a presentation based on the text they read. In this kind of activity, the students would analyze the reading material in order to present it after reading. The teacher perceived that in group presentations the students can share their ideas of analyzing the reading text. In addition, the students can get feedback from both the teacher and the other students based on the question or comments. Based on this view, it can be considered to be useful for students when they are not confident to share ideas in a big amount of students as they can just share it to the groups to be presented. Besides, the students would also think critically when they get the questions regarding to their opinions in the presentation. It is in accordance with Bristol (2013) who stated that there are several reading strategies that bring students' opinion to get better understanding. One of those question-and-answer strategy that is raised by the teacher to check the students' understanding about what the text is telling. Another one is question generating strategy in which the teacher gives the students a chance to generate questions and raise those questions to one another as they can test their understanding toward the text. Therefore, those strategies are effective to be implemented in presentation after reading.

Next strategy is case study, where the students have to find out the case being discussed in the reading text. It is usually done before presentation, so the students have to do it in a group. This strategy is quite similar to discussion, yet in case study, the students focus on one particular case and then analyze it based on their prior knowledge about the case being discussed. The students can also give judgment based on their analysis. Besides, the teacher also gives several questions to the students in order to have the evidence of their judgment. The teacher stated that this strategy is usually combined with conclusion drawing strategy by asking the students to make a summary of the reading material. This can be useful to encourage the students to do the reading activities, so that they do not only read to answer teacher's question but also to understand the story in detail. Even the teacher sometimes asked the students about their position regarding the story. By understanding the story in detail, it might help the students connect their prior knowledge with the case in the text. When the students are able to understand and analyze the story in detail until they can conclude the story, it brings them to critical thinking. This is supported by Tung and Chang's (2009) study that indicated literature reading is helpful in improving students' critical thinking through the appropriate strategies. This means, strategies in literature reading sources are also applicable in stimulating students to think critically toward the content of reading materials.

In the interview, the teacher stated that she does not always implement all of the strategies of teaching reading based on her belief. She sometimes implements strategies that are appropriate with the topic or classroom condition. Even though she has her own personal belief toward the strategies of teaching reading, it still can be changed. The strategies of teaching reading implemented by the teacher were various and there were several factors affecting her beliefs on the teaching strategies. As stated by Borg (2003) there are 4 main factors that affect to the teacher's belief which are schooling background, personal coursework, contextual factors, and classroom practices. Those factors play a significant role in forming the teacher's beliefs. This is also shown in the findings of the present research that the teacher agreed that those factors are affecting her beliefs on several strategies before the teaching and learning process. According to the teacher, the most affecting factor to her belief was the teaching practices or her own experience in teaching. This is because the teacher could have new knowledge based on the real situation of teaching. However, Borg (2003) stated that contextual factors play a significant role in determining the extent to which the classroom practices are congruent with teachers' cognition. This indicates that it can be different among teachers or researchers regarding the factors affecting the beliefs. It depends on how often the factor appears in the teaching and learning process.

The Practice of Teaching Reading to Foster Students' Critical Thinking

Based on the findings obtained from the observation, it revealed that there were several teaching strategies and classroom activities implemented by the teacher in teaching *Advanced Reading*. In the 7 meetings of observation, it was shown that the strategies the teacher used were varied as well as the reading materials. For the reading materials, there were fiction and non-fiction materials which had to be analyzed by the students. The consideration of choosing those materials was because in real life, the students will face the situation where they have to read whether for obtaining information, conducting study, analyzing reading sources, and many other needs. For the teacher, reading materials were also one of the essential parts of teaching reading. Therefore, in the interview the teacher stated that reading materials also need to be considered. This is in line with Sulisty's (2011) statement that people have different purposes in reading, some of them read for their enjoyment and some others read for gaining information around the world. Even though there are different purposes of reading, the teacher tended to focus on the way of receiving information in a critical way of thinking. That is why the teacher provides different kinds of reading materials. This was shown not only in the interview but also in the observation of classroom practice where the teacher provided two different kinds of reading materials which were article and novel.

For the teaching strategies in the classroom practice, it revealed that the teacher frequently implemented the cooperative learning through discussion in which the teacher guided the students to have interaction by discussing the reading text so that all of the students were responsible for their reading activities as they have to share what they have got from the reading text. In group discussion, the teacher always stimulated the students through several questions as explained in the findings. This strategy seemed to be helpful for the students to have better understanding toward the reading text as they were allowed to ask or give their own opinion. When they were able to do the questioning or give arguments, it indicated that they understand not only the meaning but also the specific information the writers want to tell to the readers. This is in accordance with Wooley (2011) who stated that the goal of teaching reading skill is leading the students to have overall understanding of what is described in the text rather than to gain meaning from isolated words or sentences. This proves that group discussion will guide the students to have better understanding on the text they read. Besides, the teacher can also assess the students' understanding by observing their discussion.

Nevertheless, the findings of the present research indicated that not all of the students had good participation in discussion. There were few students who seemed to be passive and rarely gave opinions toward the reading text. This shows that the cooperative learning strategy works well when the students are confident and encouraged to think critically toward the reading text. Even so, the teacher always attempted to encourage the students who were not confident enough to share ideas in the group discussion by stimulating them through questions and paying more attention to those students. In addition, the teacher solved this problem by giving feedback to the students. It was shown in the findings that the students were more encouraged when the teacher mentioned their names for the questions and when the teacher gave feedback whether it was correction or compliment of their answers. This is in accordance with Bacay (2004) who states that classroom discussions help the students understand and apply what they have learned and it is more valuable when the teacher provides feedback. As the teacher is able to solve the problem in implementing this strategy, she implements this strategy frequently. This showed that the teacher's practice in implementing group discussion was also congruent with her belief.

In the teaching practice, the teacher also implemented questioning and answering strategy in the reading activities. The finding of this research indicated that the teacher always conducted 3 steps of reading which are pre-reading, whilst-reading, and post-reading. Questioning and answering strategy was implemented in each step of reading. In pre-reading, before the students were asked to read the reading text, they were given several questions toward a particular topic. In whilst-reading activity, the students were sometimes given the opportunity to prepare questions or even raise the questions to the other members of the group when they had small group discussion in reading novel chapter as explained in the finding of this research. While in post-reading, the teacher frequently asked questions related to the reading text or book the students had read, especially when they have presentation or storytelling. As the teacher stated in the interview, the questioning and answering before reading was useful for students to build their prior knowledge regarding the topic of the reading material. This was also useful to make the students ready and focus to read in the following activity. She also believed that questioning and answering strategy could help the students obtain the specific information easily.

Likewise, there are several theories supporting the implementation of questioning and answering strategy. The psycholinguistic theory of reading, for example, which was advocated by Goodman (1982) and Smith (1988) describes reading as a selective, active, and cyclical process when readers predict information, sample the text, and confirm the prediction. This clearly indicates that predicting information through questioning and answering strategy could bring the students to have thinking process in reading. Besides, it is also proven in Puspitarini's (2015) study that the teachers believed that building prior knowledge about the reading content, monitoring reading comprehension constantly, scanning, skimming, and using visual support are the reading strategies that have an important role in teaching reading. Similar to other studies and theories, this strategy is called comprehension monitoring according to Babbitt (2002) as it consists of pre-reading activity such as knowing the vocabulary meaning, whilst-reading activity such as questioning the details related to the text, and post-reading activity, for instance, making the conclusion of the text that have been read. In other words, the questioning and answering strategy is involved in the 3 steps of reading activity and can be modified with any kind of activities which are appropriate for the materials.

Another strategy the teacher implemented in the teaching practice was generating ideas through making summary and presenting it in the form of storytelling. It was clearly stated in the finding of this research obtained from the observation that the teacher also implemented summary making as the strategy used in the post-reading activity for the novel reading material. Even though the students were asked to read a novel in a group, they had to retell the chapter they had gotten individually after making the summary of the chapter. In the result of the interview, the teacher also mentioned about her belief on the implementation of making summary after reading activities. This indicated that the implementation of this strategy is in line with the teacher's belief. The teacher explained that the summary making can help the students to be accustomed to understand issues or information by reading as when they are able to make a summary of what they read in their own words, it means that they have understood what is being discussed in the text. This is also correspondent to Babbitt (2002) who advocated many kinds of reading strategies and one of those is making summary. In making summary, the students would summarize about the text and develop it into their own language to be shared whether in written or spoken form.

However, based on the result of the interview regarding the teacher's beliefs toward the teaching reading strategies and critical thinking, the teacher did not mention the summary making strategy as her belief. This indicates that the teacher did the improvisation

on her teaching practice depend on the factors affecting beliefs. Even though a teacher has beliefs that bring his/ her to the teaching practice, not all of it can be implemented as there will always be the factors faced by the teacher that may change his/ or her beliefs as the time goes by. Based on Borg's (2003) statement about the 4 factors affecting teachers' cognition which are schooling factors, professional course, contextual factors, and classroom practice including teaching practice, contextual factors are the ones that may modify their beliefs or lead to the inconsistency between beliefs and practice in class. It proves that in the practice of the teaching reading in fostering critical thinking the teacher had modified her belief by implementing summary making strategy, this means that the change of beliefs can give the variation of the teaching and learning process depend on the factors that occur in the teaching practice.

In addition, the teacher associated summary making strategy with speaking in the form of storytelling strategy. In the teaching practice, she asked the students to retell the chapter they got after they had made the summary of the chapter they read. The result of the interview also indicates that the teacher stated that reading can be integrated with the other skills as the teaching and learning process needs to be varied by making products of what the students have learned and obtained from the reading activities. That is why the teacher implemented the storytelling strategy. When the students are able to deliver the story that they have read and answer the teacher's questions related to the story, it indicates that the students have already understood not only the content of their reading material but also the implicit information or deep meaning on that novel. Therefore, the teacher always gave critical questions to each student after he/ she finished retelling the story. The questions raised by the teacher were different depend on the story they brought such as *"how could the problem occur?"*, *"what is the good way of solving that problem if you were the main character?"*, *"if you were the character would you do that? Why?"* *"Do you think it would happen in real life? Why? Do you believe it?"*. This would be helpful for students to get used to thinking critically and reading with a deep understanding as this is fulfilling the requirement of critical thinking based on the definition stated by Ennis (1987) that critical thinking is "a reasonable reflective thinking that is focused on deciding what to believe and what to do". Therefore, the storytelling strategy will help the teacher to foster students' critical thinking to the extent of analyzing the chapter they read.

Based on the results of this study, the teacher conducted those strategies by following the critical thinking stages which are applying and analyzing. This is shown in the students' discussions and questioning activities where the students need to analyze others' points of view of the reading material. Before analyzing the points of view, the students had built the concept of the topic of the reading text by connecting it with their prior knowledge they had. However, in the teaching reading strategies the teacher implemented, it was not found that the teacher implemented the other critical thinking stages such as evaluating and creating. According to the teacher, she tended to use analyzing as the implementation of critical thinking as mostly she conducted discussion based on issues or problems. Even so, she sometimes guides the students to evaluate their own opinion through several tasks such as finding the proof on the reading materials, asking the experts, or conducting a field study.

Nevertheless, there are stages of thinking proposed by Bloom (1956) namely: knowledge, comprehension, application, analysis, synthesis, and evaluation. It indicated that evaluating is the highest stage of thinking where students do not only have a good comprehension but also can evaluate the knowledge they have gotten while the teacher did not implement this stage in the observed teaching practice. The reading activities involved the analyzing stage where the students used the information they got from the text to analyze in the form of discussion and questioning and answering. On the other hand, the students did not give the judgment on others' point of view that could be the evaluating stage as stated by Huit (1998) that the evaluation level focuses on making assessment or judgment based on an analysis of a statement or proposition. Therefore, it can be concluded that the critical thinking stage the teacher implemented was analyzing through discussion and questioning and answering strategy.

The Relationship between Teacher's beliefs and the Practice

The findings of this research indicates that the teacher has particular beliefs on the strategy of teaching reading before she implements the strategies. In the previous discussion, it is revealed that the teacher implemented several strategies that are in line with her beliefs. As described in the result of the observation, the teacher was ready and well-prepared in conducting the classroom activities through the strategies she had in her belief. This occurred since the teacher had understood well the factors that brought her to her beliefs. Therefore, she could make a decision of strategies she would implement in the teaching practice.

Nevertheless, it is also shown in the findings some of the incongruence between the teacher's beliefs and her practice. Some of the strategies stated in the teacher's beliefs were not implemented in the teaching and learning process. The teacher also stated in the interview that not all of the strategies in her beliefs are always implemented. It depends on the material of reading, or the students' characteristics, even the limited time as well. The table below shows the gap between the teacher's beliefs and practice obtained from the observation and the interview.

Table 1 The congruence between teacher's beliefs and practice

Num ber	Teacher's Beliefs and Practice		
	Aspects	Beliefs	Practice
1	Integrating critical thinking skills in reading		
	a. reasoning,	v	v
	b. analyzing,	v	v
	c. evaluating,	v	-
	d. problem-solving,	v	v
	e. decision making	v	v
2	Implementing stages of higher order learning in reading activities		
	a. remembering,		
	b. understanding,		
	c. applying,	v	v
	d. analyzing,	v	v
	e. evaluating,	v	v
	f. synthesizing	v	v
		v	-
3	Teaching reading strategies:		
	a. Case studies		
	b. Group/ classroom discussion	v	-
	c. Presentation and Questioning	v	v
	d. Summarizing		
	e. Storytelling	v	v
	v	v	
		v	

Based on the teacher's explanation in the interview, her beliefs might be changed as the time passes by since there would be improvement or adjustment in her class. In other words, the teacher's beliefs are changed based on the factors that affect her beliefs. This is in line with Borg (2003) who stated that the four factors of teacher cognition play a significant role in forming and changing the teacher's beliefs. The arrangement of teacher's beliefs that leads to the incongruence is common in the study of EFL/ ESL classrooms. In accordance with Negueruela-Azarola (2011) who has stated that actions in the real classroom are not always in accord with beliefs. This opinion is also supported by Borg's (2006) argument regarding the incongruence between the teacher's beliefs and practice that theoretical and practical knowledge are two different sources of knowledge. The teaching and learning process cannot always occur in accordance with the practical knowledge. Thus, the teachers are responsible in managing their beliefs to decide whether or not applicable for the students by considering the factors of teacher cognition.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of this research, the researcher concludes that the teacher tends to use the strategies that can foster students' critical thinking in reading as she perceives that reading and thinking cannot be separated. The teacher believes that thinking critically on the issues or information provided in any reading materials is important since the students need to be selective in deciding what to believe or make a judgment on the issues they read. Therefore, the teacher always conducts reading activities that lead students to analyze and share their own opinion.

The results obtained in this research indicates that the teacher has beliefs on several strategies in teaching reading. The strategies are case study, group discussion, and presentation of the text's summary. Meanwhile, for the teaching practice the researcher

finds that the teacher implements several strategies. The strategies are group and classroom discussion, presentation and questioning, summarizing, and also storytelling. Some of the strategies are congruent with the teacher's beliefs and some others are not in line with the teacher's beliefs. Even so, there is a main concept the teacher has in her belief and she also implements it that is the belief on integrating critical thinking skills and implementing stages of higher order learning in reading activities. The teacher acknowledges that the beliefs of the teaching strategies might change in the teaching and learning process. Therefore, the teacher's beliefs are formed and implemented as needed.

Based on the conclusion of this research the researcher found several essential points which then became a consideration proposed as suggestions for English teachers and further researchers. First the teachers are suggested to understand the students' characteristics before implementing the teaching reading strategies in fostering students' critical thinking. Teachers had better focus on the beliefs they had before implementing the strategies as beliefs can be used as a guide of the teaching practice. As the critical thinking skills can be integrated in reading as the need of this digital era, teachers need to consider the strengths and the weaknesses of the teaching strategies in fostering students' critical thinking in order to help the teacher to organize the classroom activities so that the students are more encouraged and motivated to think critically when reading. The second suggestion for further researchers who would like to conduct the same study on teacher's beliefs and practice is to analyze the implementation of the specific teaching strategy in two different classes to differentiate more significant results. In addition, the time quantity for the classroom observation needs to be added for the better result of the students' performances after being taught using the particular strategies. The last, the correlation between teacher beliefs and the practice should be analyzed more, especially in the implementation of the strategies in the whole process.

REFERENCES

- Atkinson, D. (1997). A Critical Approach to Critical Thinking in TESOL. *TESOL Quarterly*, 31 (1), 71-94.
- Alisaari, J. & Heikkola, L. M. (2017). Songs and Poems in the Language Classroom: Teachers' Beliefs and Practices. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 231-242.
- Anderson, R. C., Hiebert, E. H., Scott, J. A, and Wilkinson, I. A. G. (1985). *Becoming the Nation of Readers*. The Report of the Commission on Reading. Washington, DC: National Institute of Education.
- Babbitt, P. (2002). Scaffolding: Strategies for Improving Reading Comprehension. *Prentice Hall e Teach*.
- Bacay, M. S. (2004). *Class Discussions: its Benefits*. (Online), (<http://www.edtl.nus.edu.sg/brief/v7n2/sec3.htm>), retrieved on August 22nd 2018
- Bamanger, E. M. & Gashan, A. K. (2014). In-Service EFL Teachers' Beliefs about Teaching Reading Strategies. *English Language Teaching Journal*, 7(8), 14-22.
- Birello, M. (2012). Teacher Cognition and Language Teacher Education: Beliefs and Practice: A Conversation with Simon Borg. *Bellaterra Journal of Teaching & Learning Language & Literature*, 5(2), 88-94.
- Bloom, B. (1956). *A taxonomy of educational objectives*. New York: Longmans Green.
- Bogdan, R. C. & Biklen, S. K. (2003). *Qualitative Research for Education: An Introduction to Theory and Methods*, (2nd Ed.). Needham Heights, Massachusetts: Allyn and Bacon.
- Borg, S. (2003). Teacher Cognition in Language Teaching: A Review of Research on What Language Teachers Think, Know, Believe, and Do. *Language Teaching*, 36(2), 81-109.
- Borg, S. (2006). *Teacher cognition and language education: Research and practice*. London: Continuum.
- Bristol. (2013). Choosing whether Students Work Individually, in Small Groups or as a Whole Group. The Economics Network. (Online). (<http://www.economicsnetwork.ac.uk/handbook/seminars/44>), retrieved on August 22nd 2018.
- Choy, S. C. & Cheah, P. K. (2009). Teacher Perceptions of Critical Thinking Among Students and its Influence on Higher Education. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 20 (2), 198-206.
- Davidson, B. (1998). Critical Thinking Faces the Challenge of Japan. *Inquiry*, 14 (3), 41-53.
- Day, R. (2003). Teaching Critical Thinking and Discussion. *The Language Teacher*, 27 (7), 25-27.
- Ertmer, P. A. (2005). Teacher Pedagogical Beliefs: The Final frontier in our quest for technology integration. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 53(4), 25-39.
- Geertz, C. (1973). *Interpretation of Culture*. United States: Basic Books, Inc.
- Goodman, K. S. (1982). *Language and Literacy: the Selected Writings of Kenneth Goodman*. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.
- Huitt, W. (1998). *Critical thinking: An overview*. *Educational Psychology Interactive*. Valdosta, GA: Valdosta State University.
- Karavas-Doukas, E. (1996). Using Attitude Scales to Investigate Teachers' Attitudes to the Communicative Approach. *ELT Journal*, 50, 187-198.
- Kubota, R. (1999). Japanese Culture Constructed by Discourse: Implications for Applied Linguistics Research and ELT. *TESOL Quarterly*, 33, 9-35.
- Khader, F. R. (2012). Teachers' Pedagogical Beliefs and Actual Classroom Practices in Social Studies Instruction. *American International Journal of Contemporary Research*, 2 (1), 73-92.
- Kuzburoska, I. (2011). Links between Teachers' Beliefs and Practices and Research on Reading. *Reading in a Foreign Language*, 23 (1), 102-128.
- Latief, M. A. (2013). *Research Methods on Language Learning, An Introduction*. Malang: UM Press.
- Lune, H. & Berg, B. L. (2017). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*. England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Miles, M. B. & Huberman, A. M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis: An Expanded Sourcebook* (2nd Ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Negueruela-Azarola, E. (2011). Beliefs as Conceptualizing Activity: A Dialectical Approach for the Second Language Classroom. *System*, 39, 359-369.
- Paul, R. & Elder, L. (2007). *The Thinker's Guide to Analytic Thinking*. New Jersey: Foundation for Critical Thinking Press.
- Puspitarini, Ika. 2015. *ESP Teachers' Beliefs in Reading Strategies and Teaching Reading Strategies*. Unpublished thesis. Malang: State University of Malang
- Richardson, V., Anders, P., Tidwell, D., & Lloyd, C. (1991). The Relationship between Teachers' Beliefs and Practices in Reading Comprehension Instruction. *American Educational Research Journal*, 28(3), 559-586.
- Riswanto, Risnawati, & Lismayanti, D. (2014). The Effect of Using KWL (Know, Want, Learned) Strategy on EFL Students' Reading Comprehension Achievement. *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, Vol. 4, No. 7(1), 225- 233.
- Rusmawaty, D., Atmowardoyo, H., & Hamra, A. (2018). Teachers' Beliefs of Authentic Materials for Teaching Reading in Indonesian EFL Classrooms. *Journal of Language Teaching and Research*, 9 (3), 608-613. DOI: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17507/jltr.0903.21>
- Sato, K., & Kleinsasser, R. C. (1999). Communicative language teaching (CLT): Practical understandings. *Modern Language Journal*, 83, 494-517.

- Shinde, M. B. & Karekatti, T. K. (2012). Pre-Service Teachers' Beliefs about Teaching English to Primary School Children. *International Journal of Instruction*, 5(1): 69-86.
- Sulistyo, G. H. (2011). *Reading for Meaning*. Malang: Pustaka Kaiswaran Press.
- Tung, C & Chang, S. (2009). Developing Critical Thinking through Literature Reading. *Feng Chia Journal of Humanities and Social Sciences*, 19, 287-317.
- Vaseghi, R., Gholami, R., & Barjesteh, H. (2012). Critical Thinking: An Influential Factor in Developing English Reading Comprehension Performance. *Advances in Asian Social Science*, 2(1), 201-410.
- Ziauddin, K. (2004). *Teaching Reading Skills: Problems and Suggestions*. Pakistan: University Khaipur.